

1 THE HONORABLE RONALD B. LEIGHTON  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6

7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
8 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
9 AT TACOMA

10 THOMAS CASCADDAN,

11 Plaintiff,

12 v.

13 THE PRUDENTIAL INSURANCE  
14 COMPANY OF AMERICA,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:17-cv-05402-RBL

**JOINT STIPULATION FOR DE  
NOVO STANDARD OF REVIEW**

15 Plaintiff Thomas Cascaddan (“Cascaddan”) and Defendant The Prudential Insurance  
16 Company of America (“Prudential”) (collectively, “Parties”), by and through their respective  
17 counsel of record, hereby stipulate that for purposes of this case only, this Court shall apply a *de*  
18 *novo* standard of review to Prudential’s decision denying Cascaddan’s claim for long-term  
19 disability benefits at issue in this case, including without limit at trial, on summary judgment and  
20 in all other proceedings and hearings. The parties further stipulate that this matter will be heard  
21 on FRCP 52 motions for trial on the administrative record. *Kearney v. Standard Ins. Co.*, 175  
22 F.3d 1084, 1095 (9th Cir. 1999).

23 Prudential’s agreement that its decision shall be reviewed *de novo* is in recognition of the  
24 Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals’ decision in *Orzechowski v. Boeing Co. Non-Union Long-Term*  
25 *Disability Plan*, No. 14-55919, 2017 WL 1947883, \_\_ F.3d \_\_ (9th Cir. May 11, 2017), and  
26 applies only to the Court’s review in this particular case.

27  
JOINT STIPULATION FOR DE NOVO STANDARD OF REVIEW  
(No.: 3:17-cv-05402-RBL) - 1

119219.0023/7064235.1

LANE POWELL PC  
1420 FIFTH AVENUE, SUITE 4200  
P.O. BOX 91302  
SEATTLE, WA 98111-9402  
206.223.7000 FAX: 206.223.7107

1 Notwithstanding anything in this Stipulation, the Parties agree that Prudential reserves its  
2 right to assert that the abuse of discretion standard applies to its denial decision if, while this case  
3 is still pending in this Court, (1) the Ninth Circuit grants a rehearing or a rehearing *en banc* in  
4 *Orzechowski*; or (2) the United States Supreme Court grants *certiorari* in: (a) *Orzechowski*, or  
5 (b) another case raising the same issue. The Parties further agree that, in the event that Prudential  
6 elects to assert that the abuse of discretion standard applies, Prudential will promptly notify  
7 Cascaddan of its intent and, moreover, Cascaddan will then have the right to file a motion to  
8 determine the proper standard of review in this case even if the dispositive motion deadline has  
9 passed.

10 The Parties jointly request their stipulation to be entered as an order of this Court  
11 governing further proceedings in this action.

12 DATED: September 6, 2017.  
13

14 ROY LAW

15 By s/ Chris Roy (per e-mail authorization)  
16 Chris Roy, WSBA No. 29070  
chris@roylawpdx.com

17 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
18 Thomas Cascaddan

LANE POWELL PC

19 By s/ David W. Howenstine  
20 D. Michael Reilly, WSBA No. 14674  
reillym@lanepowell.com  
21 David W. Howenstine, WSBA No. 41216  
howenstined@lanepowell.com

22 SEYFARTH SHAW LLP

23 By s/ Tara Ellis  
24 Ian H. Morrison, *Pro Hac Vice*  
imorrison@seyfarth.com  
25 Tara Ellis, *Pro Hac Vice*  
tellis@seyfarth.com

26 Attorneys for Defendant The  
27 Prudential Insurance Company of America

## ORDER

IT IS SO ORDERED. The Parties' joint stipulation for de novo standard of review is hereby APPROVED.

DATED this 13<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2017.

Ronald B. Lightner

Ronald B. Leighton  
United States District Judge